Making the Case for a Paradigm Shift in Community Cat Management, Part Two

Kate Hurley, DVM, MPVM, Director of the UC Davis Koret Shelter Medicine Program.
Julie Levy, DVM, PhD, DACVIM, Director of Maddie’s® Shelter Medicine Program at the University of Florida.
Rich Avanzino, President of Maddie’s Fund® and former Director of the San Francisco SPCA.
Jon Cicirelli, Deputy Director of San Jose Animal Care and Services and Board Member of the California Animal Control Directors Association.
Holly Sizemore, Director, Community Programs and Services, National Programs for Best Friends Animal Society

Jon,

What are the guidelines for Shelter Neuter Return (SNR)?

Which Cats are Candidates?
• Relatively HEALTHY – no major wounds, illnesses, or un-thriftiness.
• At least 4 months of age* (rabies, survival).
• About 2,000-2,500 per year.

What about the Environment?
• Cats are not TNR to environmentally sensitive areas
• Several parks in San Jose participate in TNR on some level.

*Note: Rabies vaccination is required for cats under 4 months of age.
Feral Freedom in San Jose

- Government Agency is a primary participant.
- City does intake, spay/neuter, vaccination, chip, tip, and recovery during hold period.
- Non-profit rescue group takes cats from shelter and releases cats.
- No releases to environmentally protected areas.
- Non-profit manages educational material, website, and phone line for questions/concerns.
- [www.catcenter.org](http://www.catcenter.org)

Holly,

How do we educate those who believe the cats are “better off dead”?

Innovators and early adopters

[Diagram showing the adoption timeline from Innovators to Laggards with Shelter TNR and Community TNR points]

Question #2
Advocating for TNR in your community

Best Friends TNR Action Kit:
- FAQ sheet
- Information checklist
- Generic PowerPoint


San Antonio Program Video

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Z2Km0IqwZNOQ

Jon,

What cost differences are there between programs like this and “catch and kill”? 

Question #3
Cost of Large-Scale Lethal Control

# Cats
406,000

FY12-13 Animal Care Budget
$6.5 million

2012 Cat Intake
8,375

Budget Spent on Cats
$1.95 million

Cost per Cat
$233

Cost to Pick up ¼ of San Jose's Cats
$23.7 million

Dr. Levy,

Will this program make people just decide to do nothing about cats?
Question #5

Rich,
Will people start using inhumane private means to eradicate nuisance cats?
“When 70% of the cats coming into shelters are dying, it’s causing great harm. And it doesn’t have to continue. At this point in our history, the most ethical, moral and cost-effective solution is to stop bringing community cats into our shelters.”

- Richard Avanzino

Dr. Levy,

How can we get government bodies on board with this concept?

Jacksonville municipal code

“The City of Jacksonville recognizes the need for innovation in addressing the issues presented by feral, free-roaming and other community cats. To that end it recognizes that there are community care givers of cats, and acknowledges that properly managed community cats may be part of the solution to the continuing euthanasia of cats . . .”
Community cats

- *Community Cat* means any free-roaming cat that may be cared for by one or more residents of the immediate area who is/are known or unknown; a community cat may or may not be feral.
- Community cats shall be distinguished from other cats by being sterilized and ear tipped; qualified community cats are exempt from licensing, stray and at-large provisions of this ordinance and may be exempt from other provisions directed toward owned animals.

Community cat management program

- Required
  - Sterilization
  - Vaccination against rabies
  - Ear tipping
- *If* a person is providing care, cats must be fed daily and cats must not be allowed to suffer
- Caregiver certification program *may* be implemented by the city

Other progressive code updates

- Adding options for moving pets out of shelters sooner
  - Litters of puppies and kittens less than 6 months old without a nursing mother have no required hold period
  - No hold period for feral animals
- "Due to the low reclaim rate and high euthanasia rate for cats, all cats that do not have positive, traceable identification . . . may be sterilized immediately upon intake and placed in the adoption area as soon as 2 days after impound" (but still have 6-day required hold)
**Question #7**

Jon,

Do we know what happens in neighboring shelters when this program is adopted?

---

**Question #8**

Dr. Hurley,

Do complaints to government agencies go up after this program is implemented?

---

**Santa Clara County Cat Intake**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Felino</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>16467</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>15355</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>14776</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>13621</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Scheduled or limited intake if:

- *Today*, you don’t have the resources to provide spay/neuter/return
- *Today*, the outcome if admitted will be euthanasia of that cat or another
- The cat is not suffering, at immediate risk, or causing danger in the community

[Sutter County animal shelter to stop accepting healthy stray cats](http://www.appeal-democrat.com/articles/cats-117165-shelter-hurley.html)

Catching on

**Pasco Says ‘No’ to Feral Cats**

The county’s animal shelter no longer accepts feral cats and strays.

*By Bill Lindelof*  
*June 19, 2012*

New Port Richey residents who are tired of hearing the mewing of feral cats in their neighborhoods at night can no longer round them up for a drop off at Pasco County Animal Services.

As part of its Save 90% program, the county has decided to change the way it handles intakes. That program charges the county with saving 90 percent of the animals brought into its Land O’ Lakes shelter.

Feral cats and strays, however, can make that goal difficult to obtain. That’s why the county has put the brakes on its old policy of accepting cats carte blanche.

[Redrawing the map](http://newportrichey.patch.com/groups/politics-and-elections/p/pasco-says-no-to-feral-cats-c56017b7)
“Except for a few people that we have been unable to have a reasonable conversation with, once we explain to people why we changed our policies, they usually understand. Word is out since we had a gentleman come in saying he knows we don't accept feral cats, but where can he get traps to do TNR.”

“A jerk with a map can act just like a saint.”

“Several groups are involved, including a new group which was formed to specifically do TNR. The great thing is all the animal welfare groups are giving the same message to the public, so that helps a great deal. We have gotten a lot of support from the media and the public, and it vastly outweighs the people who are against it. So far so good!”
Providing a map for staff

[Flowchart Image]

Providing a map for staff

~ 75% decrease in intake so far

[Flowchart Image]

Getting easier!

“While I can’t quantify complaints, I think the public is aware of our new policies for the most part and we are getting fewer calls overall about picking up stray cats, trapping cats, and to turn in kittens. We are certainly getting fewer walk-ins with kittens or strays. Staff has commented that it is actually getting easier to talk to the public about not accepting cats :-)”
As of last week:

LOIS HENRY: Don't freak out over new feral cat policy

Despite fears that the new policy could cause an explosion in the feral cat population, the shelter handles each a number number, regardless to the overall population that experts agree it won't make the situation any worse.

But turning away those not and funding up some, employee time and shelter space could be hugely beneficial, according to others in the animal welfare biz who've already traveled this path.

Wooded is just at the beginning stages of this new policy as she hasn't figured out every twist and turn.

Her goal is to be able to give residents bringing in feral cats other options.

Say yes while saying no

How can I help YOU solve this problem?

- Resources for finding/keeping/rehoming
- Spay/neuter/vax
- Lost and found and rehoming resources
- Resources for co-existence
- Spay/neuter/vax
- Non-lethal deterrents
- Responsible care
- Scheduled intake for "adoptable" cats, scheduled surgery for healthy un-adoptable

Holly,

Do people start relocating or dumping cats on their own if they can't bring them to the shelter?
Best Friends community cat program

1. Cats enter shelter
2. Determine eligibility of cats for TNR
3. Eligible cats fixed and returned to impound locale
4. TNR all community cats in return area
5. Mitigate nuisance issues

Cat deterrents

Deterrents minimize conflicts with property owners

- Non-lethal
- Effective
- Easily accessible
- Deterrent video:

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5nnOibg6nYc

In plain sight
Dr. Hurley,
What is the role, if any, for managed colonies in this new paradigm?

Do community cats need to be part of managed colonies?

- Less than 1% of >100,000 cats at TNR clinics euthanized for humane reasons
- Body condition score 5/9 on shelter intake
- Annual survival of semi-owned cats up to 90% (un-owned ~50%)

How are most community cats cared for?

Summary of six scientific surveys of cat feeding: average number of cats fed 2.6 to 4; overall average 3.2
Up to 1 in 4 households feeds cats they don’t own
How are most community cats cared for?

Summary of six scientific surveys of cat feeding: average number of cats fed 2.6 to 4; overall average 3.2.
Up to 1 in 4 households feeds cats they don’t own.

SNR helps these “volunteers” do a good the right thing!

Rich,

Does this paradigm change mean retiring the concept of the “open admission” shelter?

Shelters are euthanizing an estimated 1.8 million cats per year

“It is our responsibility as animal welfare advocates to end the euthanasia of healthy and treatable animals immediately.”

-Rich Avanzino
Dr. Levy,
How should the issues of FIV and FeLV be handled in community cats?

Question #12

FeLV/FIV: 18,038 pet and feral cats

Healthy cats

Sick cats

(Levy 2006 JAVMA)

Dr. Levy,
How can we provide humane treatment to sick or injured ferals who can’t be released immediately?

Question #13
Holly,
Do S/N/R cats need to be returned to where they were trapped/taken?

Advocating for TNR in your community

Best Friends
TNR Action Kit:
• FAQ sheet
• Information checklist
• Generic PowerPoint

Dr. Levy,
What is the minimum recommended age/weight for releasing kittens?
Dr. Hurley,
What is the real health risk, and how do we educate the public about it?
Not making the headlines…

Some diseases more common in ferals than pets and vice versa
- E.g. toxoplasmosis, rabies, roundworms
- Eradicating cats is not an option
- Educate staff to educate public on simple and effective non-lethal methods to protect public health
- Wear gloves when gardening, wash hands after playing in dirt, thoroughly wash veggies, avoid undercooked meat, cover sand boxes, treat pets for parasites preventatively, and…
SN(V)R protects human as well as cat health

- Targets cats by definition at the interface between people and “the wild”
- Rabies vaccinated, non-breeding cats will hold a niche in areas where cats are being fed
- Fewer kittens and fewer unvaccinated cats decreases public health risk
- Educated feeders can practice proper feeding and litter hygiene to further reduce risk

Holly,
Can existing colonies be relocated and if so, what leads to success?

Euthanasia and live release results: Albuquerque and San Antonio cats

Significant decreases in euthanasia as a percentage of all outcomes

Significant increases in live release rates (without blanks)
Dr. Levy,
Are barn cat programs a good option for community cats who need to be relocated?

Rich,
Does this program threaten animal control jobs?
U.S. Deaths Are Down

Shelter deaths have plummeted since 1970

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Shelter Pet Deaths</th>
<th>Save Rate</th>
<th>Deaths per Thousand People</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1970</td>
<td>23 Million</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996</td>
<td>6 Million</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>3.4 Million</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015 (Projected)</td>
<td>700,000</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Jon,
The 50% - 75% conundrum: What are the facts?

Cat Intake San Jose 08-09 vs 11-12
Cats (-26%), Kittens (-25%)
Other Lethal Control...

• Almost 1 million killed since 2000 (USDA wildlife services)

• In response, coyote numbers are growing and their territory is expanding.

• Birth rates shown to increase.

http://www.sacbee.com/2012/04/30/4452212/wildlife-services-deadly-force.html#storylink=cpy

Dr. Hurley,
How can we protect community cats and other wildlife they may prey upon?

Question #22
Two part question

1. Is eradication of cats necessary for the protection of wildlife?
2. If eradication is necessary, is shelter euthanasia an effective way to accomplish this?

Is eradication of cats necessary for the protection of wildlife?

- Predation by cats is certain
  - ~6 x as many rodents/rabbits as birds

- Population impact of predation is unknown on a macro level, variable on a micro-level
  - May replace but not cause mortality of weak, sick and injured
  - May eliminate some species with detriment to others
  - Distracts from successful solutions

"A meta-analysis of predator-removal experiments in 113 systems found prey populations subsequently declined in 54 of them (Sih et al. 1985)."

"For example, pronghorn fawn survival in areas with wolves was four-times higher than in areas without wolves, because wolves suppressed coyotes and consequently fawn depredation (Berger et al. 2008)."
That cuddly kitty may be saving some lives

“Following eradication of cats Felis catus in 2001, rabbit Oryctolagus cuniculus numbers increased substantially although a control action was in place (Myxoma virus), resulting in island-wide ecosystem effects.”

Answer to part one

- Eradication of cats is beneficial in some microenvironments, harmful in others, and likely neutral in many
- Specific research and follow up is required for a given location to predict and monitor the impact of feline eradication

Is shelter euthanasia an effective tool for feline eradication?

- At least 50% removal required for eradication
- Estimated 30-80 million un-owned cats in the U.S.
- Estimated feline euthanasia ~ 2 million and heading downward
- Increase of 8-20x required for eradication
- Removal short of eradication is not useful
Cat eradications have been attempted on islands in all the world’s oceans. We found 87 successful campaigns on 83 islands… Of the 87 successful campaigns, eradication methods are known for 66 (76%). On average, each campaign employed 2.7 eradication methods including leg-hold traps (68%), hunting (59%), primary poisoning (31%), cage traps (20%), and dogs (24%). All successful campaigns for which methods are known on islands >2500 ha (n = 9) utilised primary poisoning with toxic baits, with the exception of Santa Catalina (3890 ha) and San Nicolas (5896 ha).

**Reality check: what does it take to eradicate cats?**

- Euthanasia in shelters is not sufficiently targeted, cost effective nor extensive enough to eradicate cats
- Effective methods to eradicate cats would not be tolerated by our society as a whole
- Discontinuing euthanasia as a perceived panacea for wildlife at risk will allow for development of effective solutions
“As long as private livestock producers can externalize the costs of predator losses via government-subsidized predator control, they will have little incentive for responsible animal husbandry techniques, i.e., reduce stocking levels, clear carcasses and after-births quickly, confine herds at night or during calving/lambing, install fencing and fladry, or adopt numerous other non-lethal preventive methods to avoid depredation (Shivik et al. 2003).”

**Theory**

---

**Practice**

**THE SACRAMENTO BEE**

Suggestions in changing Wildlife Services range from new practices to outright bans

By Tom Knudsen
May 6, 2012

“We’ve pretty much learned how to control coyotes on our own,” said Jensen, whose losses to coyotes have declined 60 percent to 70 percent— from about 50 lambs a year when a federal trapper worked there to 15 to 20 today. “Anything that can help you 24 hours a day, like electric fencing, is a good thing.”

---

How can we balance the lives of free-living cats and those of the wildlife they prey on?

- Plant species that provide birds with food, cover and nesting
- Create a brush pile in your yard
- Provide a source of water
- Feed birds responsibly
- Reduce pesticide and fertilizer use
- Prevent window strikes
- Help conserve habitat
- And...
SNR: Win/win for cats and limiting cat populations

- San Jose City Animal Services SNR program:
  - 25% decrease in intake
  - 17% decrease in DOA cat pickups
- Shelter/neuter/return targets: cats being fed without adding more cat feeders; may reduce reproductive output of cats in communities
- Find other solutions for cats trapped from environmentally sensitive microenvironments

Holly,

How can the paradigm shift work in areas with harsh weather conditions?

What is the Best Friends community cat program?

A partnership between Best Friends and select municipal shelters with the common goals of:

- TNR > 3,500 annually, including impounded cats
- Reduce cat euthanasia by 25% by end of year 1
- Reduce cat intake by 10% by end of year 2
- Increase live release rate by 35% by end of year 3
Interested in learning more?

Holly Sizemore
hollys@bestfriends.org
435-644-2001 ext. 4877

---

Jon,

How can we effectively counter all the anti-cat PR making headlines lately?

---

Does this explain why TNR works better than lethal control?

- A lot of it comes down to nutrition and competition. When you have fewer animals (coyotes) on the landscape, you have more food available per individual. There is a ton of food on the landscape. Why not have a bigger litter?" said Stewart, the Nevada ecologist.

- [http://www.sacbee.com/2012/04/30/4452212/wildlife-services-deadly-force.html#storylink=cpy](http://www.sacbee.com/2012/04/30/4452212/wildlife-services-deadly-force.html#storylink=cpy)
Goals Of TNR

- Non-lethal population reduction
- Healthier and safer cats
- Lower adverse impacts
- Reduced public complaints

What about neighbors who do not want cats back?

Education at time of impound
- Deterrents (cat stop)
- Benefits of cats in neighborhood
- Relocation LOCAL
- Officer options, case by case

Rich,

Institutional change is hard; what works when it comes to getting government agencies and animal groups on board?
The American people support our lifesaving efforts:

71% of people polled say animal shelters should only be allowed to euthanize animals when they are too sick to be treated or too aggressive to be adopted.

Evaluation Survey

https://www.surveymonkey.com/s/J7P6NRT